



Creative Champions Network Webinar – March 30, 2021

Board Recruitment: How Does Successful Succession Planning Work Today

Speakers:

Jaclyn Rodrigues, Community Engagement Manager, Toronto Arts Foundation

Jini Stolk, Toronto Arts Foundation Research Fellow and Creative Champions Lead

Denny Young, Board Chair, Toronto Mendelssohn Choir

Robin Cardozo, Executive-in-Residence, Rotman School of Management and co-author of 2021's *Not-for Profit Board Diversity & Inclusion*

Meredith Baade, MBA Candidate, Rotman School of Management

Transcribed through Otter.ai, edited by Alexandra Loewen

00:00:00 – 00:01:45	Jaclyn Rodrigues	All right, well, good afternoon, everyone. Welcome. I hope everyone's had an opportunity to enjoy some of the warmer weather and sunshine we've been experiencing today. My name is Jaclyn Rodrigues and I'm the Community Engagement Manager with Toronto Arts Foundation. We're delighted that you're able to join us today for this webinar, you know, in this online world that we found ourselves in. I'll keep my remarks brief today, as my role is really as a moderator for our Q&A towards the end of the session, and help troubleshoot and technical issues that might come up. As some of you may know the Foundation is hosting this webinar as part of a Creative Champions Network and is going to be hosted by Jini Stolk, our network director. What we hope for a smooth session, we are grateful for your patience as we troubleshoot any technical issues that may come up. Well, next on my list, is to set the proverbial stage for today's webinar. After these introductory remarks, we'll proceed with the presentation. Now if you have a question for our presenters, please use the Q&A function. And please feel free to ask a question at any time during the presentation via the Q&A function. Please specify in your question which presenter you'd like to direct your question to. It helps us keep the Q&A moving quickly. Well, we will address the questions at the end of today's webinar. And we'll strive to get to as many questions as possible, but we'll be prioritizing the most frequently asked questions. Now while there was no request for ASL interpretation, or closed captioning for this session, we are recording it. We will make a recording and a transcription of the session available on our Foundation's website as soon as possible. With that, I'll turn it over to Jini, our Creative Trust Fellow and leader of Creative Champions Network to you, Jini.
00:01:46 – 00:08:08		Thank you, Jaclyn. Thank you so much. And thank you for everybody for being here today. Jaclyn and Alexandra, I want to just say a few words of additional thanks for your input into the development of the Creative Champions Network for your invaluable assistance with our webinars

including this one. And as always, for the technical expertise I totally rely on, thank you. So, this is the eighth webinars since the start of the pandemic. Previous to that the Creative Champions Network met in lovely small rooms with wine and cheese, and people had a chance to network. But I have to say that the webinars have been I think serving a purpose. Our goal has been to help boards navigate or it's really been an onslaught of very novel difficulties. And to bring together some inspiring ideas and hopefully to also inspire courage to you in facing your many tasks and unexpected tasks and challenges.

But I feel that now we're almost at the point where we can begin to focus on what comes next. Some changes and we've seen so many such changes will be lasting. And one of the most noticeable during the past year has been the large number of retirements or simply comings and goings among artistic and professional staff. Now, these are not necessarily because of COVID. But I think they definitely signal a different landscape ahead. I personally believe that similar change and evolution will also be true of boards, they'll probably be less visible. I don't think we're going to see articles in the Globe or the Star as our board members change and people come on our boards. But I think this will have as important an impact on our organizations as the changes to the professional leadership's So what makes me think that? Well, I think part of the transition that we'll see on boards will be because of exhaustion. It's been an it's been an exhausting year. Some of it will be because change always leads to more change. But the past year has also been a testing ground around the urgent need for all hands-on deck for everyone to come together, bringing their best ideas and varied skills and experiences to solving what have been really difficult problems. Which by the way is how really good boards have always worked. And really good boards are needed now more than ever. During this most high risk of yours, that it's become clear who around your board tables is contributing and making a very positive difference. And who really cares who putting heart and soul into their board work. So, whether your board has had the process Practice of regularly evaluating groups and each individual's effectiveness or not. I think real life has provided that evaluations. In addition to the overturning of almost everything about business as usual, there's also been rapid and urban urgent changes in community expectations around equity, BIPOC representation and voice. So, there will be changes on our boards. And perhaps the reason we have so many people here with us today is because you already grabbed one of our introduction to the session said that board composition is at the use of board effectiveness, and that renewal and succession is one of an arts board's most important leadership roles. I'm happy to say that our panelists today have thought long and hard, and bring significant professional and personal experience to understanding what that means and how to do it successfully.

Before I introduce them, I'd like to invite you to join together in acknowledging that we're living on sacred land, which has been the site of human activity for 15,000 years or more, and the traditional territory of

		<p>many traditional peoples, anything mindful that we are only the most recent people to have the responsibility to care for and to nurture this one. This year, I think we're being called upon not just to honor the spirit and wisdom of those first peoples, but to be in active solidarity with Indigenous women and men's pursuit of justice and reconciliation, which is really a call to conversation and transformation in pursuit of a new and more equitable future.</p> <p>Beyond that, I think that spring also reminds us that the cycles of life continue, and that we've been given the duty to live in balance and harmony with each other and all living to our panelists. They're very distinguished group, so I'm going to introduce them very briefly. Denny Young is a specialist and has taught and researched board recruitment and management and he's currently the Board Chair of Toronto Mendelssohn Choir, lucky them. Meredith Baade has an impressive work history, and she's currently an MBA candidate at the Rotman School of Management. And she's recently been working with a major non-profit organization on best practices in recruiting for diversity. And Robin Cardozo is well known for his senior non-profit leadership positions. He's currently Executive in Residence at the Rotman School of Management. And he's also the co-author of the recent paper, <i>Not for Profit Diversity and Inclusion: is it Essentially Window Dressing?</i> So, a good group, and I hope a good discussion. Danny, could I ask you to lead us off?</p>
00:08:08 – 00:29:34	Denny Young	<p>Thank you, Jini. I'll just take a moment here to bring up my slides. There we go.</p> <p>Good afternoon, everyone. And first thing I will say is that a takeaway file with keynotes of my presentation will be posted in the comment section. So, I'm going to be brief. But there are there's home. There's things to take home after this. A few years ago, as Jini mentioned, as part of my master's degree research, I looked into best practice of board recruitment. First thing I did was gather what experts say is best practice. And then I went out in the field and compare that against what actually was taking place in a number of US and Canadian Performing Arts groups. In the years since then, I've continued to gather information about board recruitment, and particularly, it's been a fascination of mine. And now, as Jenny mentioned, I'm chair of the board of the Toronto Mendelssohn choir, which gives me a chance, like likely everyone else who's here today to put into practice what I've been studying. I'm doing my best to practice best practice and that's what I've called my presentation. Practicing best practice coming from arts organizations, you already perfectly understand that no one is ever perfect. No performances ever perfect. The key is to practice to learn to practice some more. So, I'm going to share six stories with you. These stories are based on my research and what I've observed in the years since, but they are fiction. I made them up so don't spend your time looking for clues on I'm not cleverly trying to portray any specific person or organization. These stories are just created to give you a quick look at good or bad practice. And each portrays a particular factor of it.</p>

We'll start with Craig's connection. The theater companies nominating committee is trying to decide which person to pick for one vacant seat on its board of directors. There are two candidates. Mark was suggested by the community relations VP at BA bank. BA bank donates to the theatre company. And the bank VP said that up and coming executives of the bank need to demonstrate community service and Mark, she suggested should join the board to polish his resume. Mark is a 37-year-old investment banker he's divorced with two young children. In his spare time, he coaches boy's hockey and winter and teaches sailing in summer. He's a member of the Royal Canadian Yacht Club and he sits on the club's finance committee. He has no history of attending Theatre Company shows, nominating committee members figure that his annual income is close to \$1 million. Craig's first contact with a theatre company was as a volunteer Usher during high school, and he continued doing that when he studied drama at Ryerson. After graduation he went to law school in the Queen's he stopped us during but to subscriptions and attended shows with his partner Jason when he was home on in Toronto on weekends. Greg is now 63 years old and a partner in a small labor law firm. He and his now husband Jason continue to be subscribers. Jason is a high school music teacher. Their total household income is estimated to be in the range of about \$400,000. Craig recently contacted the Theatre Company's board chair offering to volunteer in any capacity that would be helpful. Practicing best practice the nominating committee has chosen to recommend Craig to the board. rec best practice recognizes that board members who have an affinity for an organization's mission are more dedicated, more reliable, and more generous. Super surprise.

The music festival just added Suba to its board and accomplished musician, teacher and CBC radio host Suba has performed at the festival three times in the last five years. Board Chair Scott is proud of recruiting super to the board. At first she was cautious and she asked about the time commitments what were the donation expectations, and she very specifically asked if she could still perform at the festival, Scott assured her that they'd work it out for her at Suba's first board meeting the festival CEO hands Suba a package of information containing several documents, among them a conflict of interest policy, a schedule showing board meetings every two weeks, a pledge card for an annual \$2,000 donation and a financial report showing that the festival is currently having a five figure deficit. As she's absorbing this new information, the meeting begins and the first agenda item is a vote to ratify the festivals new statement of values, super notices that the statement speaks of transparency and honesty. After the meeting, she approaches Wendy and Scott. She says does the conflict of interest mean that I can't perform at the festival? Scott says Well, we'll work it out. Wendy says no. You can't be a performer if you're a board member Suba then says I can't afford the \$2,000 donation. Wendy says Well, that's what board members have to do. Scott says Don't worry, I figured that you could use your radio show to ask people to donate super points to the financial report and asks is the festival really that foreign debt? And when he says yes. But

now that you're on the board and making connections? We figure we'll get businesses in the South Asian community to become sponsors. As Scott and Wendy engage in it another heated discussion Suba heads home where she composes an email to Scott and Wendy, the subject line with full transparency I hereby resign, honestly, the thing is, words are nice. But does your recruitment follow your own stated practice and your values? I found quite often recruitment did not people talked about their organizations being transparent and honest but then didn't share information with board members until they'd made the decision to join the board. Or they were told different things by different people. So, practice consistency, that's pretty key.

Freida's Frustration. Freida is arriving at her first meeting of the dance project board. She's never been on a board, but Freida feels confident that she will be a helpful, productive member. After all, she already sits on the parents committee of her son's alternative school, where parents, staff and teachers engage in monthly discussions about everything from school operations to what to teach and even how to teach Freida's neighbors love her because she gets things done. Every two weeks she attends the meeting of her housing Co-op, where 60 residents sit down and make all the decisions using consensus. Freida enjoys the lively discussions and seldom notices that the meetings run three hours or more. And dance continues to be a big part of her life. Two evenings a week free to runs dance classes for homeless youth at her neighborhood community center. So now it's free to settles in at the dance project board meeting she's excited to see that the first item on the agenda is approval of a new program for death for teenagers. free to ask the question. The board chair tells her that discussion can only occur after a motion is on the floor. So, someone makes a motion another person seconds it for you to start to ask your question again. But the chair interrupts are to say that the mover of the motion is entitled to speak first. I yield the floor says the mover. So now free to asks Will this new program only offer classical ballet? Yes, replies the executive director. In our 50 years we have never strayed from our classical traditions. A free to then starts to comment. But the chair interrupts are to say this is a governance board. We don't interfere in operations. Several directors then start saying call the question call the question. The chair then says All in favor carried. That's kind of how it all goes. And then Freida is surprised when the meeting ends after only 35 minutes and the room empties in a hurry. As she's putting on her coat feeling alone and confused the chair hands free to a book titled Robert's Rules of Order. Heading for the door. He says you should really study that before the next meeting. The thing is, our board meetings are conducted in a way that's completely foreign to the way most people make decisions. I dare say that when you're in your home trying to figure out whose turn it is to cook dinner tonight. You're not practicing Robert's Rules of Order. It's okay to have formal press programs to run your board. The challenges make people aware of that's the way things are done. Don't leave it until they've joined the board to find out that they feel excluded because the process to them is

		<p>completely unusual. It's a common way that people have their first interaction with the board. That's a negative one.</p> <p>I missed one. I have to go back. Maybe I didn't. Okay, we're going on to Mei's match. Mei is excited. Tonight. She's becoming treasurer of the music schools Board of Directors two years ago may join the board after a thorough process that helped her understand that her love of music, and her professional expertise would be highly regarded and very valuable to the music school his continued success for years 40 years ago, at age eight may started violin lessons at the school. She was good. She was really good. She won competitions. She sailed through exams, and she loved playing. But these parents were fearful that she couldn't make a living as a musician and they encouraged her to take Business and Economics at university. And she did. But she also kept playing violin to including four years in the principal violin Chair of the school's elite orchestra. At the same time, maybe became more and more passionate about finance. top of her MBA graduation class may went to work for the big province pension fund. She's now its chief financial officer, and it's a job she loves. But tonight, she's equally excited to be taking on this volunteer leadership role for the music school. Mei said that with her head for finance and her heart for music, it's a perfect match. She knows that the school is facing some tough financial challenges, but may we'll make certain that it continues to be going strong when that next eight-year-old walks through the door. For the first time picks up a violin and a bow. No one joins a board with the intention of failing, but they do. And it's often because their interests and skills don't fit what's needed. Honor a recruit's time and their knowledge and their expertise by making sure that you're providing them with a situation where they can succeed.</p> <p>Rami's relief. Rami's boss tells him that if he wants to move up in the company he should get some community service on his resume. Rami asks friends and family for suggestions and his sister in law Gail says that a family health clinic in her neighborhood is looking for board members. Rami calls the health clinic and in a few days he is meeting with board members Greg and Lisa at the clinic. They're warm and welcoming and enthusiastic and they thank Rami for visiting. And then they take him on a tour. As they move him around the building Rami becomes more and more comfortable. Since childhood. He's always hated hospitals or clinics or even dental offices. Greg and Lisa are bursting with pride as they talk about the clinic. Rami wants to show appreciation when he can't stop worrying that he's soon going to see blood or hear a sick person crying out in pain. They finally end up in a quiet room where Lisa and Greg say, Are you okay? Rami? Can we get you water or anything? No, thank you. He says that's very kind. I'm sorry. It's just a places like this make me really uncomfortable. Very says, Hey, Rami, we appreciate your honesty. Volunteering should be an enjoyable thing. Funny, even Ronnie says you're not angry with me. Not at all, says Lisa. Last year Greg tried to get me to volunteer at his golf club. And I told him I'd rather die. Greg than says yeah, and she wanted me to join our choir and all they sing is stupid Broadway stuff. Rami It was good to</p>
--	--	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

meet you. But the point of a meeting like this is to help you find a successful fit. Something that you feel good about not something that makes you sick to your stomach. Romney says but you to love this place so much. Aren't you offended? Don't you want everyone to volunteer here? No, we don't says Greg. We want volunteers to love this place as much as we do. Sure. But we know this cause can't be everybody's cause. You've got to find a place you're passionate about Rami. Rami, then says, Greg is that golf clubs still looking for volunteers. We need to practice no pressure recruitment. Canadians are terrible at saying no. That's the one thing I didn't really notice between my the US and Canadian organizations I studied, Americans are quite willing to say it's not my thing. I love it, but not my cause. Canadians don't know how to do that very well. And they'll actually join a board when they don't want to. So you need to look for those hints that they're uncomfortable or not interested. You need to stop thinking about guilt tripping them into joining your board, because I promise you this. people that join a board, even if they hate what's going on, they're really hard to get off the board. Oddly, they kind of stick like glue. And they don't really do anything, but they feel that it would look bad if they quit. And so they stick around and everybody feels awkward about it. The recruitment is when you have the chance to make sure they're going to feel comfortable, and you're going to want to work with them.

And finally, Larry's letter. After several meetings, tours, visits, interesting and enlivening conversations and lots and lots of reading. Larry's head is spinning. He's enjoyed meeting the Pinewood centers, board members, the staff, the volunteers and the clients. He's been impressed when observing the excellence of center programs. And being a guest at a board meeting gave Larry the chance to see that he would feel comfortable there. Louise, the board chair is due at Larry's office shortly. And he's sure she's going to make the Ask Larry, are you joining our board? And he's almost certain that his answer will be yes. But he wants this board experience to be better than the last one. This time. He wants to be absolutely sure about what's expected of him because Larry hates to fail. And he hates that feeling that everybody else is thinking he's neglecting something or doing something wrong. As Louise enters Larry's office, he thinks well, it's decision time. After exchanging greetings and settling in, Louise opens a folder. She says Larry, this is letter of agreement. It outlines everything that we've talked about in the past weeks board responsibilities, liabilities, meeting schedules, donation expectation. It's all there, Larry. At the center, we value transparency and honesty, we would like you to join the board, but only if it's right for you. Larry starts to speak. And then he hesitates, Luis says, Larry, I don't want your decision. Now. Take time. Read the letter carefully. If you have any questions, get in touch. Again, we believe we would enjoy having you as a board member. And we think you'd be proud of your contributions to the center's success. But take your time, and make sure it's what you want to do. I'll be in touch in four or five days. After Louise leaves, Larry goes over the letter. She's right. It's all there. All those things, people told him things that he was afraid he'd forgotten or misunderstood. It's all

		<p>there. Outline clearly. Two days later, Larry calls Luis, he says, if this is any indication of how professionally and thoroughly and thoughtfully your board operates, then please Count me in. We do letters of agreement for staff or contractors or suppliers. Why don't we do it for the people, we're recruiting to our most senior role in the organization. We all go through those experiences where we take in a lot of information at once. And we start to wonder whether we understood it all. And there's nothing better than outlining that all in writing and then giving a person a chance to thoughtfully consider it. Those people will be your best board members because they have gone through a good process. And then at the end in writing, it's outlined what's expected of them. And you've given them a chance to read that and not expected their answer immediately.</p> <p>Just want to wrap up by saying once somebody joins a board, and this is something I'm paying a lot of attention to now, as chair of the board of the Mendelssohn is making sure that people feel like they're contributing, making sure that they feel like what they have matters that they're involved. First thing that we like to talk about doing and we're working on putting into effect is making sure that every new recruit has a buddy, somebody who's a veteran board member who can fill in all those gaps. I was installed years and years ago that soap opera writing covers two and a half days in five days of broadcasts. And the reason is they have to repeat everything. So that when somebody who is new to watching the broadcast can pick up the story quickly. So, the dialogue is very stilted. You'll hear people say, Wanda, who is my sister in law, the one who had a coma last year, just told me you know, nobody talks like that, but they do and soap operas. We don't talk like that in boards, we jump in, we start moving. And people even if we've done our best work in preparing them are going to have moments of getting lost, they need someone they can rely upon. We I'm just about to launch something at the Mendelssohn. I've created an anonymous feedback survey that board members can go to and give me the chair feedback about meetings are about feeling like they can contribute. They can't feel like they don't feel that their opinions are respected. They're all basic, really quick questions there that just won't give me feedback that I need to improve my chat sharing skills. Every board should have an annual review process that is in two parts. How did we do? And how did each of us do? This year, I posted for the medicine board our goals for the year? What are we going to do this year as a board? And we agreed to those. So, we will look back on those in 12 months and say how did we do? At the same time, our governance committee will look at each individual board members performance, and then I will speak with them individually. And we'll see if how they're feeling about their experience and give them some feedback about how they're doing all of this to say that the key thing that I found out is that the best boards take this seriously. They hold each other accountable. They don't make excuses. They don't give people a chance to slip and slide out of the requirements. They make this as important as it is. So, I'll stop there.</p>
00:29:35 – 00:30:07	Jini Stolk	Thank you. Thank you, Denny. So, it's all about people. It's a lot of it is about people. Thank you for your stories and your good advice. Meredith,

		<p>I'd love you to speak next, and to share some of your thoughts and things that you've found through many discussions. about recruitment with an emphasis on recruitment for diversity, including age and gender diversity.</p>
<p>00:30:08 – 00: 37:44</p>	<p>Meredith Baade</p>	<p>Sure thing, okay. And you can see my screen. Okay. Yep. Great, thank you so much, Jini. And thank you all for having me here today. My name is Meredith Baade, I'm a second year, full time MBA student at the Rotman School of Management and I have participated in the onboard program at Rotman via which I've been paired with the Toronto Foundation this year working on a project for them. And in particular, I was working on board recruitment with a focus on diversity, equity and inclusion. So those are some of the things that I'm going to talk about today. And then in the second half of the presentation, I'm going to be talking on age diversity, and particularly looking at millennials and younger generations on boards.</p> <p>So, just to jump right in, I focused, as I mentioned, on diversity, equity and inclusion on board recruitment. And the first, you know, I think the first key takeaway just jump right in is, is that it's equally important to determine skill and diversity needs at the board level. But to start with skills, the overall goal is to really enhance board effectiveness and make sure that a board is performing and it's seeing through its mission. So we really need to start with skills. I know that somebody I think the individuals name was Naomi typed in the chat about, like tokenism and token hires, and no one wants to feel that way. And that's always why we start with skills, examining what skills are needed to further the mission of the board. And so that's something that I did with the Toronto Foundation, I looked at the individuals who were leaving the board, there were four of them within the next two years who were leaving, and we just examined together, what gaps might there be in skills that we're going to need to replace? And so firstly, if it's a replacement exercise, but secondly, we have to think of, okay, where's the Toronto Foundation? Or where does your non-profit, where's it looking to go over the next few years? Are there skills on this list that are not present that we should include there? So that's kind of the first way that we were thinking of, like board recruitment, but then also, of course, we consider diversity needs too and so I think another key point that I want to mention is that diversity is both we talk about it, we talk about it, it is both important, intrinsically and instrumentally. When I say intrinsically, I mean that diversity is important for diversity sake, look, you know, it will say things like looking like the city, right, or feeling like the city, but also diversity is, I would say even more important because what it does is it fosters this concept of diversity of thought, and that different perspectives are brought to the table that lead to ultimately different opinions and better outcomes for the board enhancing that board effectiveness. So that's kind of the thing that I wanted to underscore there. And so, what we had done with the Toronto Foundation is just looking at our board makeup and especially the board makeup when the for leavers leave and see, okay, where are we deficient in certain areas? Where are we, where are we overrepresented in certain areas, and that could help that can help inform our recruitment</p>

efforts. And I think that, you know, I convey this in a way that's like a benchmarking activity, or like a, quote, activity or targets. But I really want to just like, I think it's important to stay away from that kind of mentality. So, while it is de facto, kind of a benchmarking exercise, it's not meant to be a benchmarking mentality in that we have to hire this and this and this, and these are, this is exactly what we need. It's more meant to be kind of a vision, more meant to be that the non-profit is, is working towards its vision of being equitable at being diverse, and so therefore, it's going to hire or bring on board members accordingly. Something else that was interesting that I have found, which is that there's not um, skills and diversity are actually not totally mutually exclusive, right, like diversity can be a skill set. So when we're thinking about enhancing diversity on a board, we actually want people to be versed on the value of it and that we're looking for individuals with experience in these areas D and I, that goes beyond the putting together a, you know, a luncheon at the diversity luncheon, right? Like it's what advocacy work has an individual done for a community that they're a part of, or community that they're not a part of, and that kind of finding has really stuck with me and, and I want to share it with you all because it's kind of helping inform the way I'm going to be living my I tried to live my life I'm going forward.

So, moving on to more of the equity piece, I think that what I have found rather than prophecies are the outreach and the selection process, in particular can be made more equitable by being made more formalized, more objective and more measurable. And starting with the outreach process, um, I think overwhelmingly it is the case from what I've observed, from what I've read. And also, from talking with my classmates in that onboard program. We're also working with other non-profits, that word of mouth is really the prevailing method for recruitment or for outreach and sourcing candidates to join the board. And while there are definitely merits to this approach, and I don't recommend scrapping the word of mouth approach, I think that there are things that can be done to enhance that word of mouth approach to make it more equitable, because unfortunately, with the word of mouth approach has, like the downside of it is that it has the potential to and it does has perpetuated long standing inequities, and kind of makes it worse.

So, I think that things that can be done are reaching deeper into our like, reaching deeper into our networks, having everybody equally on the board reach more deeply into their networks, people that they have worked with people that they might be a second degree connection with, let's say on LinkedIn, you know, just really kind of going out there and trying to train a little bit harder on that word of mouth approach. I also think that there are tons of associations, community associations, professional associations, throughout Toronto, in this case, or your community that can be tapped into, like, one example would be the Canadian Association of Black Lawyers is one that, you know, could be reached out to. And then finally, and then sorry, in the selection process as well, being having things like an objective, more objective rubric, and with weighting as scoring, and, and removing from that rubric on

		evaluating candidates removing things like cultural fit. cultural fit is where we can drop in there are where we don't realize where we might put up some of our implicit biases. So, taking away that very subjective cultural fit, for example, from a rubric would be something to do to kind of enhance equity in this selection process. And then finally, just a note on term limits, term limits are a mechanism for which to keep that board turnover. Like when seats are open to fill it with somebody to enhance diversity on the board. And I also realized I jumped right in before mentioning that when I talk about diversity, in my in my report and findings and research, it was really about age, gender identity, sexual orientation, ability and race. So, this is when I talk about diversity, I speak of it in those areas.
00:37:45 – 00:38:02	Jini Stolk	Meredith, I hate to do this, but um, time is going by. Can I ask you to quicken the pace a little bit, we want to make sure that we hear from Robin and have time for questions after? Really sorry.
00:38:03 – 00:39:30	Meredith Baade	No problem. Yeah, sure. Um, so essentially, I looked at I did a survey of my classmates and found out why there might be a lack of representation of younger generations on boards. And you can see what it is on the screen here, basically, that we're unaware of opportunities, they seem inaccessible, that we have to be really successful and have 20 years of experience to sit on the board. And then there are things that we can do to that there are things that millennials and the younger generations can contribute. You'll see here that that we're what we're driven by giving back passion, networking, things that we can bring to the table, are really important. And I just if it's one thing that I want to highlight, it's that fresh perspective. Every single one of my classmates who I surveyed said that they that younger generations, they believe can bring a fresh perspective to the board. And that ties back to what I talked about that diversity of thought that is a benefit of having diversity on a board, it's being brought that fresh perspective to enhance board outcomes, and then also to make board structure a little bit more amenable to younger generations. [Technical issues, some speech inaudible] One thing and I think this also makes back to what I was saying is something that doesn't reward and I'm going to join now, if only, you know, opportunities present themselves, and I will end it. issues
00:39:31	Jini Stolk	There. Thank you, Meredith. I think your screen froze a little bit, but one of my questions for you is going to be how we as boards as organizations need to change what we need to do to attract young and crucially culturally diverse people to our board. I think that's a full discussion that we might be able to get into during some of the Q&A. Robin can you please join us now? Robin, you're you. I think you're muted. Robin still muted?
00:40:30 – 00:50:30	Robin Cardozo	Okay. Thank you. Sorry about that. Here we go. So I was invited to talk about a report that I was recently involved in, in publishing and based on a research study that a colleague of mine at Rotman, Matt Fullbrook, and myself completed. And thank you to Danny and Meredith, for your remarks, and I think my remarks build on yours. Talk about recruitment and diversity. Really our report asked a provocative question about diversity and inclusion is it essentially window dressing, and and we

talked to 26 leaders in the sector to try to address that question. In the course of that we our report really touches on six themes. And the first theme really is if you like the headline theme, which is that more diversity is unlikely to be effective unless there's a parallel commitments to inclusion. We had many stories of organizations that were working on recruiting board members from diverse backgrounds, but really hadn't given a lot of thought to what would happen beyond that. One example. Out of the 26 people we spoke to was a wonderful night today very experienced board member and indigenous woman who was telling me the story of the first board she was appointed to, well, there was a lot of fanfare about the board having their first indigenous board member. But really, once they introduced her, they then just carried on, as though it was business as usual, completely missing the opportunity that they had made a significant step in the area of board diversity. And it was up to her really to then push back outside the meeting with the chair and the and the CEO, to find ways for her to be able to contribute to the work of the board, and to help the board being more to become more inclusive. The second theme is that successful inclusion depends on the determined leadership from the chair. Now many of us may assume the fact that that is a given. And in all people we spoke to, in fact, what we found was that all the chairs we heard about are essentially supportive of diversity and inclusion. But being supportive of diversity inclusion is not the same as a showing determined leadership in the area. Often, the chair was very busy with many, many other things. And, the whole diversity and inclusion agenda was left to others to implement. And what we found was that without that demonstration of real leadership and commitment from the chair, the issue often got sidelined. A very good news story we heard here was from the responsible gaming County Council, and whereby the chair Hanlon Granger, who happens to be a specialist in the area of diversity and inclusion, was able to build diversity, inclusion related agenda items all the way through the work of the board. The third theme we will be having is, is that really board candidates at the point of being interviewed need to take the time to inquire about how they might contribute to the organization. I think this picks up on what of Denny's stories or a similar theme, where it isn't always clear why a candidate is being recruited. And we've often been in situations of recruiting someone from a diverse community, but not putting that on the table. So here we had stories now I'll just share two completely different stories of individuals who, who, who quickly felt in an interview process, that, frankly, they will be asked because the board wanted to improve that diversity standing. And they hadn't given a lot of thought beyond that as to how the candidate would contribute. In one case, the candidate felt really annoyed by that and essentially walked away forever, from the opportunity feeling that that that was not going to be a match. Interestingly, in another case candidate said, Well, you know, I don't feel so good about the fact that they didn't give a lot of fun. to how I would contribute, however I feel I can contribute. And I'm going to say yes. Because I will really would like to be able to contribute to this organization.

And so I'm not suggesting that that but one answer, one approach is right or the other answer of the other one is wrong. The point I'd like to make is that in the really, it's up to the candidate in that situation to push back to make sure that he or she understands why they're being why they are being recruited. And it's up to the recruiter, recruiting, board chair, nominating committee chair, whoever it is to be, again, completely transparent and open about reasons for the recruitment.

The next theme is about an onboarding needs to be reimagined, what we found was that the one size fits all onboarding process really doesn't work well enough, when we're trying to recruit a diverse board, we really do need to find ways to personalize the onboarding for each individual board opportunity in order to assist every board member to contribute to that, to the best of their ability. Next, we said that lived experience can contribute hugely to the diversity of perspectives on the board. Here, I'll share an example from my own experience. A number of years ago, I was on the board of Casey house, which is and which is a hospice, for people experiencing advanced stages of AIDS and HIV. On the bylaws of the organization was that there would be at least two board members who were who would completely open about the fact that they were living with AIDS and HIV. And from my experience, I can't tell you how much that added to the ability of the board, being able to understand what our what our purpose was and why we were there.

And the last of the six themes is that what we found, as we were working through this, when talking to leaders was really the principles of diversity are aligned with all the principles of good governance, which is diversity needs good for recruitment, while good governance needs good for recruitment, onboarding needs to be personalized. But that's not just for candidates from diverse communities, it's for all candidates, the board needs to be able to recognize that as the individual needs and styles of individual board members. Well, that doesn't just apply to diverse candidates, it applies to all to all board members. So interestingly, as we gotten to this, we found that organizations that are focusing on improving that diversity and inclusion, we're really improving their board governance practices across the board. So, the last piece of our report was touching on a number of recommendations, but there are about 30 recommendations in the report. So obviously, I'm not going to go through them. But we but we broke them up into sections about recommendations for board candidates, board chairs, and so on. I'll just touch on one for each for each category.

For board candidates. One recommendation we had a suggestion is to be proactive about onboarding. Often as a new board member, we sit back and wait for the management, or the governance the nominating committee to initiate the onboarding. And yes, that is their role. However, as a board candidate as a new board member, we could also be proactive, and asking a bunch of questions at board meetings. And before and after board meetings, for board chairs. One, one piece of advice that came through was keep tabs of who is speaking and not

		<p>speaking at board at board meetings, particularly as you're trying to diversify the board, whether it's through age, cultural background, people from BIPOC communities, people have different levels of comfort around contributing that at the boardroom table. And it's partly the board chairs role to see who is contributing, who is not contributing at the table, and to find ways for those who don't have the comfort level at the table to make sure they have other ways of contributing for CEOs and executive directors. What one recommendation is to make sure and i think i think Danny touched on this already to make sure that that every new board member has both a board buddy and a management buddy so that they know who to go to for every question that they might have for nominating committee shares one recommendation and that this cuts across a lot of performing arts and arts organizations in general. The whole question of needing board members who can give or get you can contribute themselves or bring people in the door.</p> <p>The recommendation is for nominating committees to think beyond that everyone can give everyone can get, but it isn't necessarily in pure dollars. There may be other ways to be able to be able to give or get and for long standing board members. Really the one piece of advice is to be available to mentor new board members. So, as I say that the report is available to you, we have about 30 recommendations, I do encourage based on our interviews that are not just from Matt and myself. So, I do encourage you to, to access that. And I think Jenny said at the opening that board composition is at the root of board effectiveness. And really, that ties back to recruitment and the ties back to diversity and inclusion. Thank you.</p>
00:50:31 – 00:51:38	Jini Stolk	<p>Unmuting, so I can say thank you, Robin, that was wonderful. I love the connection between good governance and good practices and recruiting for diversity and equity. It's an interesting thing to keep in mind. I would like to just raise one question. It's true that after every AGM, after new people join a board always dynamics around the board table change. So, I'm just wondering about the question, how can we ensure as people who are currently on boards who have been used to certain ways of doing things, certain ways in which discussions unfold, How can we work to ensure that we are actually really open and accepting and, and enriching our own understanding through those changes that happens in the people joining us?</p>
00:51:39 – 00:52:36	Robin Cardozo	<p>I'll try to jump it on that. But in fact, I would like to challenge that. For that, that theory, if I may, Jini. I think in fact, more often than not, I think the dynamics don't change. Because I think when you've got for a typical board, if you got 15, or 16, or 18 members, and one or two new board members come on each meeting, it's going to take them a while to change the dynamics. And I think this is anecdotal. But this from my own experience, and the interviewees we, we spoke to, it was almost the opposite that the that the new board members adapt to the culture of the board, more often than not, and I think the challenge, in some ways is for the chair, and for the longest standing board members, to your point to</p>

		be open to change, and maybe facilitating and creating the opportunities for change that may not otherwise exist.
00:52:37 – 00:52:53	Jini Stolk	Good. I think you're right about that. And that's true. Do we have questions from our listeners, Jaclyn, that we should get to now? I've got other things I'm hoping to ask as well. But of course, I want to give everybody the opportunity.
00:52:54 – 00:53:11	Jaclyn Rodrigues	Absolutely. And we've touched on this a little bit, but I'm going to direct this question to Denny. Denny, can you share your thoughts on a board skills matrix to help with board renewal and succession in arts organizations? What are the key skills critical to capture in the skills matrix?
00:53:12 – 00:54:04	Denny Young	Whoo. Well, I don't want to run through a big long list. If the person wants to get in touch with me, I can show you what we use at the Mendelssohn. It's very specific by organization and but there are certain fundamental things. We, you know, for instance, we look for knowledge of music, knowledge of the performing arts, philanthropic ability of fundraising ability, knowledge of our audience segments, those kinds of things, specific kinds of skill sets as well, I would I think the simple answer is sit down and ask people, what do we need? I think that's the way we created ours in the original was to say, what is it we need in the room? But you know, I'm happy to get into more detail later if that's helpful.
00:54:05 – 00:54:07	Jini Stolk	And Denny, Will those needs change through time?
00:54:08 – 00: 54:37	Denny Young	Yeah, I think some will stay fundamental. But I mean, certainly, as you've heard, my bias is always first and foremost, they have to love the mission. Because you can't really teach people to love a mission. They either do, they get it or they don't. And so that's a fundamental and then from there, you know, it will change some things will change, some will stay the same.
00:54:38 – 00:55:02	Jaclyn Rodrigues	I'm, Meredith actually answered this question in our Q&A, but I'm gonna ask it out loud and then ask Meredith to kind of reiterate her answer for the rest of our attendees here. So, the question was, could you please recommend some best practices for recruiting board members. Currently, we depend on personal networks among existing board members, but this is a limited resource. Meredith, great answer that I would hope that you would share and potentially expand on.
00:55:03 – 00:56:26	Meredith Baade	Yeah, sure. So, I think it's, I think that there are a lot of associations out there to be tapping into. And forgive me if my internet is unstable again. There are a lot of associations to be tapping into there, I know that there are a charity village, the ICD network, of course, of individuals who have a designation that might be willing and able to join a board. And then it depends, I think it's important to think of, like the skills that you're looking to bring on as well. So, if you want someone with legal, you know, with a legal background, there are there's the South Asian Bar Association as an example. So just thinking of, you know, the type of representation that you're looking to increase, and also thinking about the skills that you're needing to bring on board and going out to foundations, or going out to associations and tapping into their networks as well. And then, of course, there's always kind of digging deep into LinkedIn for people that you might have met before, but that don't immediately come up to your come up in your mind is something else we talked about. And then they're also,

		less common, but they do exist. are leveraging a search consultant, there are some pro bono search consultants out there or just paid search consultants. So that's another that's another method.
00:56:27 – 00:56:31	Jaclyn Rodrigues	Great, Jini, did we want to dig into one of your questions?
00:56:32 – 00:58:08	Jini Stolk	Um, yeah, well, this is something that I've been thinking about quite a lot. And we sort of talked about it just a little bit. There's a lot of you know, the year past has been year, so many really profound changes in so many urgent issues raised, particularly around diversity, but just about how things are done, and where we continue to do things in the same way. So I'm still thinking about the idea that boards have to change in certain ways to attract young and culturally diverse people to join us. I wonder if, you know, it just seemed to me, particularly if we're looking for people who are from a new generation, and that generation in Toronto is really, by definition, more culturally diverse than older generations have been. One of the things that I want to do, or tried to do is to ensure that we are that the whole process of being on a board, the practice of standing on a board is interesting, exciting and worthwhile to the people that we're looking to attract to our boards. It's a big question, but I would like to hear Robin, you're nodding your head. Do you have? Do you have thoughts there?
00:58:09 – 00:59:03	Robin Cardozo	I think it's a great question, Jini. And really, really timely and really important. I'm not sure I have any magic answers. But I think you touched on something when he talked about the need for the opportunity to be exciting and interesting. I think boards, particularly art sector have a great opportunity to provide experiential opportunities for board members. And sometimes because we're short of time, we don't do enough of that. So suddenly, providing more experiential opportunities in the context of the art, both at the organization itself and in other organizations, is a great opportunity. And I'll just add one other thing. Throughout my career, I've just had informally asked people, what is it that has made what experiences most memorable to them? I like asking this question of people who have who've been on many boards. And really, two things have come out. In my experience, again, purely anecdotal, not research. Number one is when they feel that they themselves were able to influence something that happened at the board, maybe they were part of creating a new policy by bringing in a new donor, part of creating a new partnership, a new idea. And the second one was, was having fun, just simply it was an opportunity that that of being collegial and having fun. And I think both those are areas that arts boards have lots of opportunities. And in terms of bringing in people from different communities, I think I think people would respond to those.
00:59:04 – 01:00:50	Jini Stolk	In my experience, certainly that's my experience as a as a many, many board member participant. I think that Jaclyn or Alex have just posted up that if people wish to stay we are actually at all hour mark right now but it's such an interesting and really urgent discussion that the Toronto Arts Foundation is going to allow us to just stay online a little longer for those people who have urgent questions in wish to stay. And we'd like to thank people who have to leave for being here and for being part of this

		webinar for the Creative Champions Network. So, feel free to leave when you when you need to feel free to stay if you can. So, here's another large question for me. Unless, Jaclyn, there are things that you wish to bring forward that people have some have...
01:00:51 – 01:01:07	Jaclyn Rodrigues	One question here, Jini and this one's for Denny as well. And it's just your thoughts on you know, are there some best practices? Or is it different when you're creating and recruiting for a founding board for a new organization versus bringing members on to an established board,
01:01:08 – 1:03:02	Denny Young	I can tell you that I've just about finished typing a long answer to that. Because I thought I could get that done in a hurry. So, look, for it in writing. A really simple thing is to say a founding board is often in organizations, duplicating roles that would eventually be done by staff, but staff don't exist yet. And so, you're often recruiting for very practical skill, as well as governance ability. And that is necessary too because your organization is starting up. And it needs to define itself better and have policies and things put into place. The transition is challenging, and that's where I often get pulled into help, because boards move into less day to day operational work. And sometimes they don't like that they want to still be doing the hands-on things. And staff are trying to figure out well, if they're doing that, then what's my role, and that's where clashes occur. And so, if you're bringing people in, in that transition period, you need to be very clear that you're in a transition period, and that you're not looking for people who can, on Thursdays and Fridays, come into the office and answer the phone anymore, because now you have staff, but you still need the board to do particular things. And you also need to keep in mind that when you're doing your analysis of how the boards functioning, you need to sometimes, you know, remind board members, we have staff that do these things now, you need to let go. And so, I would say those are the key factors is what stage are we at what's necessary, and recruit for that. But more importantly, as every expert will say, recruit for the future, don't photocopy your present board don't look for clones, look for what will be necessary to lead this organization in the future.
01:01:03 – 01:04:14	Jini Stolk	Absolutely. So, do we have any questions? Jaclyn? Or should I raise, let me raise something that I've been thinking about? We have spent a lot of time and effort in our sector, I've been talking about developing emerging leaders. And in that we're talking not just we're certainly talking about professional leaders, or we're talking about artistic leaders, but I think that we should also expand that to talk about developing emerging board leaders. So, I want to ask, what role we as individual organizations or the sector can play in doing that. And I have a little secondary thought there. How can the leaders who we are developing further forge participation and contributions. How can they help develop us as boards and as board members? Meredith, please.
01:04:15 – 01:05:13	Meredith Baade	I can take up to start with um, and something I'm just really passionate about. And I'm answering this on the individual organization level rather

		<p>than the industry level is just that I mentioned it earlier, but really that like mentorship goes such a long way. And from the get go, establishing a mentor for a new joiner or even somebody has been involved at let's say, events and things like that. And that seems like they could be a perspective board member in the future that you kind of spot them and want to start developing them just working on establishing and, and growing certain relationships that even meeting regularly from junior to senior board members and so that they can Learn and that they can grow. And that really helps them grow as leaders. And I think that answers the first part of your question. Um, so maybe we'll defer off the second part of your question.</p>
01:05:14 – 01:06:44	Jini Stolk	<p>Well, that's part of the development of our practices as well, because I'm sure that there are lots of boards, who actually are not particularly active in the idea of mentoring people are going to think everybody mentioned that to a certain extent. But the fact that it's, it can be pretty, you really don't want any board members, I've heard somebody say, quite recently, take a year to figure out you know, how things work and what's going on, you'd like to get people contributing the best they have to contribute from very early stages. So, I think it's something that we should be doing more of and doing a better job of within the arts community. What about smaller organizations? It I have noticed that there is a kind of urgent desire from young professionals to become involved with, you know, larger organizations, but smaller organizations. Surely, since so many of us are smaller, and so much good artistic work goes on within smaller organizations. What kinds of things can we do to enhance the appeal of smaller organizations for prospective board members? Denny, any thoughts there?</p>
01:06:45 – 01:06:52	Denny Young	<p>I confess I was typing out an answer to somebody else. I'm going to lose people. So I've been trying to type. Jini, I completely confess I missed what you asked.</p>
01:06:53 – 01:07:35	Meredith Baade	<p>I could take it and just say, firstly, raising awareness, I think it starts even before even before we think about, okay, what can the board be doing now to make this experience seemed more compelling for prospective candidates? It's just even getting out there and promoting through different channels that the smaller organization exists, and that there's a role at the smaller organization? And people will I mean, I at least I would feel compelled to get involved, especially maybe if it was my first board, then maybe I'd want to start small to begin with. But I think just getting the word out there and making individuals more aware that these opportunities even exist is a great place to start.</p>
01:07:36 – 01:08:21	Robin Cardozo	<p>Yeah, yes, absolutely. I would agree with Meredith. Just to add that I think quite often the actual work that someone might do at a smaller organization is much more strategic, far reaching for very many more opportunities to influence real change in a smaller organization, and they might be in a larger organization. So the opportunity to learn and to influence real change can be terrific. And we just have to make that case. I think, more clearly, yes, there's always the, you know, the stars in the light about all the names of the big organizations, but often the in those, it's more difficult to have real influence compared to the learning and influence at a small organization.</p>

01:08:22 – 01:09:11	Jini Stolk	Absolutely. I think that board members of small organizations seeing sometimes seem to underestimate just what a wonderful opportunity, inviting somebody to join their board is. And therefore, they're hesitate, because they make assumptions about what people want and what they need from their board participation, that might not be actually true or realistic. I'm going to ask our panelists, is there a question or a final thought, or question that you'd like to ask your fellow panelists or to make yourself? Denny? Surely you have?
01:09:12 – 01:09:37	Denny Young	Okay, well, I'll throw one out. I just assumed the chair of the Toronto Mendelssohn Choir board. I've been in senior staff roles in two major arts organizations, but I've never chaired a board of one. So, I'm curious, from your experience, what should I be aware of doing and not doing as a chair?
01:09:38 – 01:10:36	Robin Cardozo	I think I would jump in and offer couple of thoughts. Great, great question. I think one is would be to identify fellow board members who could be who could provide you with honest feedback, before and after meeting because often that's again, maybe this is mentioned, as Canadians we tend to be so polite that often when people are reluctant to give or to offer constructive feedback so certainly that would be one another would be to touch base with board members for an after a meeting and I'm sure you're doing this on particularly any contentious items to try to get a sense of where of where the what the mood of the board is a list of key influence makers is on the board
01:10:37 – 01:12:48	Jini Stolk	And the question that Robin you raised or the fact that you raise that questions of change and especially diversity movements. There's somebody who I thought was smart defined find the search for diversity and other good changes to be relentless incrementalism which I think is a really good way to think about it the incrementalism means that it does take that every good change takes time but relentless offers that idea that it is something that must be done and that must be addressed and must be kept in mind in order for change and success to happen and that includes any really there's so many important changes around how boards were there's a lot of people that I've been listening to recently and reading recently who have been soul searching about whether boards are in actual fact the right structures are the necessary structures to ensure sustainability and artistic success of arts organizations so I think that part of the answer to that question is to really make our boards more open, more reflective of community more self-reflective. Meredith did you say having fun? I mean I think that was Robin. I think it's really true it could there be anything more really fun and interesting than being together with a group of colleagues, peers, friends, new friends, old friends to help make an arts organization flourish that's fun as long as okay are there any other last thoughts last questions? Yes, Denny?
01:12:49 – 1:13:44	Denny Young	I just I want to say that I did this as a staff person and I don't think I did it enough in to engage board members and that's when you get down in the details and you're working really hard it's really important and we're lucky this way in the arts it's really important to take yourself into the hole

		<p>or the theater and sit down and say I'm part of this I'm helping make this happen. We get so caught up in office and board room situations and we lose sight of the magic and the extraordinary privilege that we have to be a part of these organizations and so get your board members to rehearsals, get them into the hall make sure they and make sure they understand they're part of that that it isn't come and observe the excellent professionals aren't we lucky they're here? But make it clear that we're all in this together we need each other.</p>
<p>01:13:45 – 01:14:57</p>	<p>Jini Stolk</p>	<p>Absolutely I think we have come to the end of our time frame am I right Jaclyn I think so we said we would try to extend for 15 minutes and we have done that. I would really like to thank everybody on our panel for excellent, ideas, thoughts, inspiration, experience that they shared with us today and to thank everybody who has been listening we still have quite a few people online with us so thank you for logging in and for sticking with the conversation. Denny had said that he's open to questions and I would add that I am too so get in touch and stay tuned with Creative Champions Network and the next sessions coming along I don't think that we're at position quite yet to announce the name or the presenters that our next session but that's going to come really soon. So thank you to everybody and enjoy the day it's pretty beautiful out. Thank you very much great to see everyone.</p>